

CHATTOOGA COUNTY  
BOARD OF TAX ASSESSORS

Chattooga County  
Board of Tax Assessors  
Meeting of August 8, 2018

---

**Attending:** William M. Barker – **Absent**  
Hugh T. Bohanon Sr. – Present  
Richard L. Richter – Present  
Doug L. Wilson – Present  
Betty Brady - Present  
Nancy Edgeman – Present  
Kenny Ledford - Present

---

Meeting called to order at 9:01 am by **Mr. Bohanon as Vice Chairman due to the absence of Chairman, Mr. Barker.**

**APPOINTMENTS: None**

**OLD BUSINESS:**

**I. BOA Minutes:**

Meeting Minutes for August 1, 2018

**BOA reviewed, approved, & signed**

**II. BOA/Employee:**

a. Time Sheets

**BOA reviewed, approved, & signed**

**b. Emails:**

**1. Weekly Work Summary**

**BOA acknowledged receiving**

**III. BOE Report:** Nancy Edgeman to forward via email an updated report for Board's review.

Total TAVT 2018 Certified to the Board of Equalization – 2

Total 2018 Real & Personal Certified to Board of Equalization - 20

Cases Settled – 4

Hearings Scheduled –16

Pending cases –16

**One pending 2015 Appeal to Superior Court for Map & Parcel 57-21**

**IV. Time Line:** Nancy Edgeman to discuss updates with the Board.

**The last two appeals are on this agenda. We are back on our assigned job duties.**

**NEW BUSINESS:**

**V. APPEAL:**

2018 TAVT Appeals taken: 2

Total appeals reviewed Board: 2

Pending appeals: 0

Closed: 2

2018 Real & Personal Appeals taken: **74**

Total appeals reviewed Board: 72

Pending appeals: 2

Closed: 72

Weekly updates and daily status kept for the 2018 appeal log by Nancy Edgeman.

**BOA acknowledged**

**VI: APPEALS**

**a. Owner: Callan Earl & Judy**

**Tax Year: 2018**

**Map/ Parcel: 18-40**

**Owner's Contention:** Square footage on house is not correct.

**Owners asserted value:** \$40,000 for house (total fair market value of \$216,419)

**Determination:**

1. The subject property is 71.50 acres located on 567 Brooks Road Summerville GA and has a improvement value of \$91,068, accessory value of \$27,374, land value of \$149,045 for a total fair market value of \$267,487.
2. The current recorded heated area is 1,480 square feet with a 1,113 square foot basement at 100% complete. The house story count is 1 story finished attic.
3. A field visit with a interior inspection was done on 8/1/18 and it was discovered:
  - A. There is not a finished attic that is over the entire house only a 12x17 unfinished attic room above at the front of the house that is accessed by a lift.
  - B. A 12x23 area at the left rear corner of the house is actually an open room from the basement area to the roof. This area should be labeled a 1 story addition and subtracted from the basement area.
  - C. The front dimension of the house was discovered to be 30 foot instead of 31.
  - D. The heated area changed from 1,480 square foot with a 1,113 square foot finished basement to 1,080 square foot heated area with a 204 square foot unfinished attic and a 804 square foot finished basement.
3. During last year's appeal of the property the grade of the house was changed from 105 to 100. A different neighborhood adjustment of 78 should have been applied to the improvement due to the grade changing.
4. The neighborhood study shows a median of \$46 value per square foot and a average of \$44 value per square foot. The subject property is higher at \$62 value per square foot. Adding the finished basement area in with the heated area of the house puts it at a \$35 value per square foot.
5. The sale study shows a median of \$49 price per square foot and a average of \$54 price per square foot. The subject property is a little higher at \$62 value per square foot. Adding the finished basement area in with the heated area of the house puts it at a \$35 value per square foot.

**Recommendation:** Making the above changes which would change the improvement value to \$66,460 the accessory value would stay the same at \$27,374 as well as the the land value of \$149,045. The overall total fair market value would change from \$267,487 to \$242,879 a \$24,608 difference.

**Reviewer:** Kenny Ledford and Bryn Hutchins

**Motion to accept recommendation:**

**Motion: Mr. Wilson**

**Second: Mrs. Brady**

**Vote: All that were present voted in favor**

**b. Property: 49A--41**

**Tax Payer: LAKE WANDA RIETA APARTMENTS**

**Year: 2018**

**Contention:** Appellant is appealing based on market value and uniformity of assessment  
2018 tax appraisal is \$532,207

**Determination:**

1. Tax Appraisal on this parcel has been unchanged since tax year 2015.
2. Appellant is represented by Hannah Seaman of Fellers, Schewe, Scott, & Roberts, Inc.
  - a. Appellant is asserting a 2018 value of \$300,000.
  - b. A letter requesting data supporting \$300,000 was sent to Appellant's tax agent on 07/23/2018. As of this date, there has been no response.
3. The subject property is an apartment complex sitting on 3.98 acres located on 46 Maplewood Drive. It has an improvement value of \$500,504, accessory value of \$8,221, land value of \$23,482 for a total fair market value of \$532,207.
4. A field visit was done on 7/26/18 and the following changes were discovered.
  - a. The physical condition of the improvements has deteriorated. Most of the roofs were in poor shape and two of the apartment buildings were found to have large cracks coming from the foundation. Most of the physicals of the improvements were high, a physical of 80 was considered for all.
  - b. Changed the open porch over open porch at the rear of each apartment building to patio over open porch. Apartment buildings A and B did not have the patio over open porch recorded.
  - c. Two 3x14 utility rooms were discovered on each floor of every apartment building.
  - d. An incorrect wall height of 5' was given to each improvement. All wall heights were measured and corrected.
  - e. Four 6x120 sidewalks and one 6x110 sidewalk was discovered in front of the improvements, these were added to the accessories.
5. The comparable study shows a median of \$18 value per square foot while the average is \$19 value per square foot. The subject property is a little lower than this at \$15 value per square foot.
6. Market Analysis
  - a. As stated in item 2a above, the Appellant has provided no market or income information in support of the asserted value of \$300,000.
  - b. Properties similar to this in the county are LIHTC properties. (SUBJECT no longer qualifies for LIHTC status).
    - Per O.C.G.A. §48-5-2(3)(B)(viii) special consideration should be given to properties under rent restrictions and receiving state or federal rent subsidies.
    - There has only been one sale of such subsidized housing since 1993. That sale, Summerville Garden apartments, took place in 2010.
  - c. As such, a capitalization of net operating income has been performed, using the reported market rent of the SUBJECT and four other subsidized properties.
    - With no market basis to support a capitalization rate, and no income/expense data provided by any of these properties, a 10% cap rate and a 70% Expense to Adjusted Gross Income have been theorized.
    - Though all of these properties in this study report a vacancy rate of 5% to 7%, vacancy rate of 10% has been utilized in this study.
  - d. Based on these parameters, the value returned for the SUBJECT by this study is \$572,180. This is also the median value produced in this study. The mean value produced is \$736,646.
  - e. Based on this study, if accepted as valid, the SUBJECT property is NOT appraised in excess of market.
7. Uniformity of Assessment
  - a. These same properties were utilized in a comparison study using the HUD reported 2018 fair market rents for LIHTC properties in Chattooga County.
    - The 10% capitalization rate was retained.
    - A 7% vacancy rate was utilized based on reported vacancy rates by these properties.
  - b. Findings:

<u>PROPERTY</u>	<u>EST FMV</u>	<u>TAX APPR</u>	<u>40% ASMNT</u>	<u>RATIO</u>
GOLD LEAF	452,850	389,804	155,922	34.43%
SILVER LEAF	640,140	463,150	185,260	28.94%
GARDEN APTS	1,680,790	1,308,530	523,412	31.14%

DEVONWOOD	496,570	329,903	131,961	26.57%
LAKE WANDA	887,220	532,207	212,883	23.99%
		MEAN	29.01%	
		MEDIA	28.94%	
		AGGREGATE	29.09%	

IF the HUD asserted FMR figures are accepted as accurate, and the Vacancy, Expenditure to Gross Income, and Capitalization rates are accepted as reasonable, then the SUBJECT property is being assessed at approximately 24% of market, while the rest of these properties are assessed at about 29% of market.

**Recommendation:**

1. Leave the 2018 tax appraisal unchanged and forward this appeal to the county board of equalization.
2. Apply any changes in value due to additions or corrections discovered during the 07/26 field visit to tax year 2019

**Reviewers:** Bryn Hutchins & Roger F Jones

**Motion to accept recommendation:**

**Motion: Mr. Richter**

**Second: Mrs. Brady**

**Vote: All that were present voted in favor**

**VII: MISC ITEMS**

**a. Digest items to be signed by BOA**

1. Chattooga County Notice of Assessment Certification Statement for 2018
2. Pending Appeals for Public Utilities for 2018
3. FLPA listing for new and existing Covenants for 2018
4. List of FLPA Covenants entered into during 2018
5. Appeal Status Certification OCGA 48-5-311
6. Appeal Statistics for current year digest for 2018
7. List of Conservation Use Covenants entered into in 2018
8. Chattooga County Pending appeals other than public utilities for 2018

**Mr. Bohanon signed all documents.**

**VIII: INVOICES**

**a. Schneider (qpublic) – INV-3369 Date 8/1/2018 amount \$600.00**

**b. Parker Fibernet LLC- INV 1019999, 1020316, 1020481 Amount \$1,537.50**

**The BOA signed**

**The BOA discussed being late, leaving early, and absentees. A motion was made by Mr. Wilson that when all vacation and sick time is used a doctors excuse must be presented if you are absent, late or leave early, it was seconded by Mr. Richter, and all that were present voted in favor.**

**The BOA discussed the 2019 Budget.**

Meeting Adjourned at 10:15am

William M. Barker, Chairman

Hugh T. Bohanon Sr.

Richard L. Richter

Doug L. Wilson

Betty Brady

\_\_\_\_\_  
  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
  
 \_\_\_\_\_  
  
 \_\_\_\_\_  


Chattooga County

Board of Tax Assessors

Meeting of August 8, 2018